

## Hierarchical Reciprocities and Tensions between Migrants and Native Moluccas Post-Reformation

Hatib Abdul Kadir

Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia

Email: [hatibabdulkadir@ub.ac.id](mailto:hatibabdulkadir@ub.ac.id)

---

### Abstract

The research subject of this paper focuses on the Butonese, who are considered “outside” the local culture, despite having lived in the Moluccas islands of Indonesia for more than a hundred years. The Butonese compose the largest group of migrants to the Moluccas. This article research does not put ethnicity into a fixed, classified group of a population; rather, the research explores ethnicity as a living category in which individuals within ethnic groups also have opportunities for social mobility and who struggle for citizenship. The Butonese have a long history of being considered “subaltern citizens” or have frequently been an excluded community in post-colonial societies. They lack rights to land ownership and bureaucratic access. This article argues that Indonesian democracy has bred opposition between indigenous and migrant groups because, after the Reformation Era, migrants, as a minority, began to participate in popular politics to express themselves and make up their rights as “citizens”. Under the condition of democratic political participation, the Butonese found a way to mobilize their collective identity in order to claim the benefits of various governmental programs. Thus, this paper is about the contentiousness of how the rural Butonese migrants gained advantageous social and political status in the aftermath of the sectarian conflict between 1999 to 2003. Migrant’s ability to express their grievance in a constructive way through the politics of their representatives and state government policies have led to the new contentious issues between indigenous and migrant populations.

*Keywords: Citizenship, ethnicity, governmental, political rights*

### I. INTRODUCTION

In the post-conflict and post-reformation society, the government in the Moluccas Province of Indonesia infuses their modern development practices and democracy with communitarian aspirations from the people in which ethnic mobilization plays a part. The aim is to provide assurance that there will be no citizens who are left behind by the State’s modern projects and to prevent the return of conflict. Several scholars have argued that after the conflict and during the reformation, people strengthened their

oppositional ethnic identity to others.<sup>1</sup> Post-reformation was an age of anger. Ethnic and religious polarization grows. People believed that being a native/host society (*pribumi*) was a promising way to express their fury of being marginalized in the political-economic realm. On the local and provincial level, host societies believe that outsiders (*pendatang*) are people who cause their personal unemployment and their lack of access to the marketplace. This research analyzes the origins of this anger and jealousy among the local Moluccans towards the outsiders or migrants (*pendatang*). This paper asks, (1) what kind of conditions make the local Moluccans upset towards the outsiders? (2) How do migrants, historically, maintain their political and economical rights before and after the sectarian conflict? (3) What has changed regarding with the rights of migrants (*pendatang*) in the Moluccans in the post reformation? (4) And last, how do migrants deal with State projects to receive their citizenship rights in the Moluccas?

## II. LIVING IN HIERARCHICAL RECIPROCITIES

In 2000, sectarian conflict spread to Saparua Island, resulting in an attack on the Christian majority and the burning down of six Butonese hamlets. Despite this destruction, not many Butonese were killed during the raids in Saparua. Traditional head village (*raja*) had already warned and advised the Christian majority to leave before neighboring villagers burnt their houses. Many fled to their place of origin in Buton, Southeast Sulawesi. This resulted in approximately 160.000 Butonese fleeing to Buton, Ambon, and Seram Island.<sup>2</sup> This paper is an ethnographic fieldwork involving two villages in Aira and Yainuelo, Seram Island, from 2015-2016. These two villages were the destinations of Butonese who fled Saparua during the early 2000s.

The Butonese left their Saparua hamlets empty. Abandoned clove and coconut trees died. Unlike in Saparua, many conflict refugees farmers who fled to Aira, South Seram, had to build new relationships for tree share-cropping with the Christian population of Soahuku. They had to build a trust from the landowner (*tuan dusun*) in

- 
- 1 For a more detailed discussion see; Bouchier, David, 'The romance of adat in the Indonesian political imagination and the current revival.' in Davidson, Jamie and Henley, David *Revival of Tradition in Indonesian Politics: the Deployment of Adat from Colonialism to Indigenism*, (Abingdon, Oxon, NY: Routledge, 2007); Duncan, Christopher, *Violence and vengeance: religious conflict and its aftermath in eastern Indonesia*. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2013); Subair, Syamsul Amal, and Moh. Yamin Rumra, *Segregasi pemukiman berdasar agama: solusi atau ancaman? : pendekatan sosiologis filosofis atas interaksi sosial antara orang Islam dan orang Kristen pasca konflik 1999-2004 di Kota Ambon*. (Yogyakarta: Graha Guru bekerja sama dengan Institut Agama Islam (IAIN) Ambon, Maluku, 2008)
  - 2 Blair Palmer. "Migrasi dan identitas: perantau Buton yang kembali ke Buton setelah konflik Maluku 1999-2002". (2004) *Antropologi Indonesia : Majalah Antropologi Sosial Dan Budaya Indonesia*, 28 (74): pp 94-109.

Soahuku in order to obtain tenancy. Many Butonese refugees who came in 2001 received permission to work on the land in Aira. Most of this land much was owned by the Christian landowners of Soahuku. The Christians of Soahuku provided work for displaced Butonese farmers because the land was still relatively abundant and because they learned the habit from their parents, who had a long history of working with Butonese tenants. Christians of Soahuku realized that Airan Butonese can be trusted with growing and maintaining trees. In the first year of tenancy, Butonese farmers cultivated chili and vegetables to subsidize and profit off it, and then they began planting cassava. Butonese farmers allowed the *tuan dusun* to have chilis and vegetables when they needed them. They profited off of chilis as well. For example, a farmer named La Udin once harvested enough from his three thousand chili trees in a single year that he paid off his contract with his *tuan dusun*. Over the course of his tenancy, he shifted to cultivating long-term crops, like coconut trees. As of 2015-2016, La Udin cultivated three pieces of land (*dusuns*) with coconut trees.

The Butonese lived in *anak dusun* (hamlets owned by the sons of the village), which are under the administration of the larger village that was owned and led by *orang negeri* (village of the native or host society). They have first family settled (*mata rumah*). Mata rumah is a familial system that is accounted based on the patrilineal clan. This system is not present in the Butonese *anak dusun* where their kin system are based on a bilateral system. Unlike for other migrants, such as the Bugis, Makassar, and Javanese, the Moluccans provided land so that the Butonese could live beside them. The Butonese had been living mostly in the border between two-disputed big *negeri* (villages). On the Hitu Peninsula, the northern part of Ambon Island, many Butonese kampongs are located between two big villages. The village of Kaitetu and the village of Seith are also separated with one Butonese kampong. The village of Said and the village of Negeri Lima are separated with one Butonese kampong. The village of Uring and the village of Asilulu are separated with Larike, a Butonese village. The village of Wakasiu to the village of Alang is also separated with one Butonese village. There are only few big two villages that are not separated with the Butonese villages, such as the village of Mamala and the village of Morela, the village of Larike and the village of Wakasiu, and the village of Alang and the village of Liliboi, and the village of Liliboi with the village of Hatu are also separated by Butonese villages.

Aira is located between Soahuku and Rutah, and Yainuelo is in between Rutah and Sepa. There have been many stories of dispute regarding the land boundaries between these two big villages, Soahuku and Rutah and Rutah and Sepa. Thus, to avoid conflict, the Butonese migrants were designated to the area in between the two villages to increase the distance between them, and ideally, prevent the recurrence of deep-seated conflict between them. Butonese hamlets are located in between two big villages in order to make a distance between these two big villages that have long deep conflicts.

This article explains the paradoxical relationship between the Butonese in Aira and their *tuan desa*, Soahuku. Though the Butonese do not belong to a local customary (*adat*) group and were evicted from their first home on Saparua Island, they

retain a sense of belonging to the Moluccas. The Butonese have been incorporated within the system of commodity and labor exchanges that they have built over the generations with the landowners of the neighboring village. Within the Butonese narratives of belonging, there is the feeling of belonging to the Moluccas rather than to Buton. Second, despite the fact that local Moluccans and Butonese protect each other through a mother village-child village relationship and have built-up personal and intimate exchanges called *baku masuk* (literally “get into each other”), the groups are still suspicious of each other. Migrants are still traumatized by attacks and displacement from their homes. Though the Butonese lived for many generations in the Moluccas, they are still considered “outsiders” (*orang luar*) who have the right to rent the land, but not to own it.

### 1. Butonese Migrants Across History

Among the Christians and the Muslim Moluccans, the Butonese are the most disadvantaged ethnic group. Moluccans called them *Binongko*, a word that refers to an isolated place in Southeast Sulawesi. The name *Binongko* is denigrating because this word derogatively refers to the smell of people who rarely shower. Up until the independence of Indonesian in 1945, the people of Binongko mostly still worked in the orchards, and they did not have access to bureaucracy or education. In the 1950's, people in Muslim villages like Tulehu considered the Butonese as a lower class and intermarriage between Tulehu people and Butonese migrants was rare.<sup>3</sup> Only when the local Moluccans could not find another Moluccan to marry did they occasionally marry the Butonese. This was especially true for Moluccan women, because they are unable to propose to a man. Therefore, if no Moluccan men proposed to them, the women would marry Butonese men. Kennedy (1955) reported that many Butonese who worked in the garden received free rent on the land in return for a certain number of worked days. The land that they worked did not belong to any one individual; rather, clans or big families owned the land (*tanah dati*). Since the Butonese worked for the Moluccans in the garden, they received land for temporary housing from their Moluccan landlord.<sup>4</sup>

The number of Butonese in Amahusu, a Christian village increased rapidly in the 1950s through 1960s. Relations differed in Christian and Muslim villages regarding the Butonese. The Butonese did not share anything cultural or religious with the Christians and the only tie they had to that community was working in Christian orchards. This is

---

3 Raymond Kennedy. *Field notes on Indonesia: Ambon and Ceram, 1949-1950*, ed. by Harold Conklin. HRAF. (1955) at 60

4 Till the 1990s', Beckmann found that many Butonese lived in half-timbered house with zinc roofs constructed from sago trunks, while the Moluccan lived in more permanent houses with brick walls. Native Moluccans acted as patrons and treated migrants as their clients, who mostly worked for the Moluccans as gardeners. In exchange, the Butonese were allowed to live in the land owned by local Moluccans.

most likely because the Butonese are Muslims, so they had something in common to share with the native Muslims, such as praying in the mosques or sharing feasts together with other.<sup>5</sup> Nevertheless, the Butonese were still disadvantaged by their ethnic identity. They were treated as second-class citizens in the Moluccas. La Aru, a successful Butonese merchant who had a business for more than forty years in Ambon, told me, “In the 1960, 1970s, there was almost no Butonese who worked as doctor, intellectual, journalist, or lecturer like Christians Ambonese. They were working either in the garden or selling on the market grounds.” The Butonese created orchards from the native Moluccas land. Like on West Seram, on South Seram Island, the Butonese they generally domesticated more and a greater variety of both long age crops, such as clove and nutmeg, and short age crops, such as kale, spinach, eggplant, and tomato.<sup>6</sup>

Butonese migrants living in the central Moluccas during the early years of the diaspora faced uncertainty because Moluccan customary law gave them little space to improve their economic situation.<sup>7</sup> Moreover, given the political dispensation from the 1980s onward, Butonese were blocked from obtaining positions in the bureaucratic elite, as well as from participating in the local elections for traditional head village (*raja*).<sup>8</sup> Because of their status as settlers and immigrants, they had no rights to land or autonomous government. The Butonese lived in hamlets that were developed on the borders between two larger villages (generally known as *desa*). These satellite villages were often absorbed into a larger village that provided land for them. In South Seram for example, the Butonese settlement of Tanjung (i.e. Yainuelo) was paired with Sepa, which provided land, while Aira was paired with Soahuku.

Most local Moluccans had access to customary land (*tanah dati*), which is passed patrilineally between descent groups (*marga*). The *tanah dati* system did not allow the Butonese to have any land since they were outsiders and did not have *marga* in the customary system.<sup>9</sup> Benda Beckmann (2007) reported the situation as follows: “Being

---

5 Kennedy, 1955 supranote, 2 at 181

6 David Kyle Latinis, . Protohistoric “Archaeology and Settlement in Central Maluku, Eastern Indonesia. (PhD Thesis, National University of Singapore, 2008) at 88.

7 Adat (customary) law has developed in various ways in different parts of Indonesia and has been influenced by contact with outside religious forces, for example Islam, to varying degrees. It was codified and utilized during the colonial period by the Dutch but is continually subject to modification and re-invention. It remains important, especially in rural areas. See the discussion in Roy Ellen. 'Social theory, ethnography and the understanding of practical Islam in South-East Asia.' *Islam in South-East Asia*, M.B. Hooker (ed.) (E.J. Brill: Leiden, 1983) at 50-91. Tania Murray Li, “Masyarakat Adat, Difference, and the Limits of Recognition in Indonesia’s Forest Zone”. (2001) *Modern Asian Studies*, 35: 3. Also see, Franz and Benda-Beckmann. “Myths and Stereotypes about Adat Law: A Reassessment of Van Vollenhoven in the light of current struggles over adat law in Indonesia” (2001) *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 167. at 2-3.

8 *Raja* was a Malay title that also used in the Moluccas ranking system. Raja also means village heads, but the transfer of the raja position is based on the lineage.

9 See the detailed description of land ownership law in the Central Moluccas in Ziwar Effendi SH. *Hukum Adat Ambon-Lease*. (Pradhya Paramita, Jakarta, 1987) at 140-48.

second-class village citizens, they could acquire only temporary rights to agricultural land, and cash tree cultivation was entirely dependent on Ambonese owners who granted access to land and trees".<sup>10</sup> Several *raja* who lived in the small islands such as Saparua, Geser and Gorom, prohibited *pendatang* (outsiders) from cultivating long-age crops. The *raja* worried that cultivating long-maturation trees would incite tension and disputes of belonging between the host society and the outsiders. Most of the conflicts regard tree yield, including timber logs, flowers, fruits, and overall sharecrop contracts. Therefore, to avoid these disputes over ownership, *raja* only allowed migrants to cultivate short-age crops, which were typically easier to account for and had clearer contracts.<sup>11</sup>

After experiencing discrimination from their local *rajās*, the Butonese supported the village law reforms of 1979 in an attempt to deal with their unfavorable position.<sup>12</sup> This law awarded them rights as citizens of the village, including the ability to own land and vote for the village head. Prior to the enactment of that law, Butonese lacked the right to elect the *raja* because of their status as outsiders (*pendatang*).

## 2. Compliance and Resistance

Under the New Order regime, Butonese migrants responded positively to government projects and market transformation through land privatization, mechanization of transportation, monetization of products, and expansion of credit in the villages. The Butonese perceived the state as a modern institution that could help them achieve the status of legal citizens of the Moluccas. To legitimate themselves as citizens, they joined several organizations initiated by the government. They supported the new administrative system of state villages (*desa*) that replaced the old traditional village system (*negeri*). Under the New Order, Butonese residents in West Seram joined the LMD (*Lembaga Masyarakat Desa/Village Consultative Council*). This organization replaced the previous traditional council called the *Dewan Saniiri Negeri*. Likewise, Butonese worked compliantly with state projects improving agricultural technology for

---

10 Franz von Benda-Beckmann. *Social Security Between Past and Future: Ambonese Networks of Care and Support*. (Münster: LIT 2007).

11 Raja Gorom in East Seram Island prohibited outsiders from cultivate long age crops. Likewise, Raja Saparua prohibited outsiders from cultivating coconut trees on their land. In Saparua, this rule became even stricter after the sectarian conflict that broke out in 1999.

12 The Village Law of 1979 (*UU Tentang Pemerintahan Desa*) sought to standardize the structures and practices of village government across the nation. The law aimed to democratize and to modernize village governance. One of the directives was that the village head must be elected or directly assigned by the central government (*pemerintah pusat*). This law was in opposition to customary village tradition (*adat*), in which the village head (*raja*) was appointed through the descent system. For a specific case in the Moluccas see: Juliet Lee. "The changing face of the village in Ambon". (1997) *Cakalele: Maluku Research Journal*. 8: at 59-77; Yando Zakaria, R. *Abih tandeh: masyarakat desa di bawah rejim Orde Baru*. Pasar Minggu, (Jakarta: Lembaga Studi dan Advokasi Masyarakat, 2000).

vegetable production. They chose to trust the government because they expected the state to provide them with legal citizenship status in the Moluccas in return for their compliance and support. As a result, their adherence to modern politics led to the sustained development of their communities

Until the 1980s, few Butonese migrants in central Moluccas had access to bureaucracy or education. They used state instruments to gain respect from native Moluccans and to assert their rights as Indonesian citizens. Under the New Order regime, the Butonese were completely dependent upon the goodwill of the government. That dependency could be used against them. Under the New Order, rural people were depoliticized and under pressure to vote for Golkar (the ruling party of Suharto's New Order). Even when choosing Golkar, the Butonese believed that this party would provide development opportunities for their hamlets. Butonese support for Golkar was not only due to fear of the state, but also a strategy to gain favor and, therefore, more autonomy and more rights from their Moluccan co-villagers.<sup>13</sup>

Under the New Order regime, the migrant Butonese in Central Moluccas villages were even more responsive to state agricultural projects because their ambitions to be sovereign from the Moluccans were strengthened. Bertrand (1995) viewed this responsiveness as compliance after completing a case study, in the villages of Mamua and Waitomu at Hitu peninsula. Bertrand (1995) found that the Butonese were highly cooperative and enthusiastic in their response to state agricultural intensification projects. The Butonese maximized their use of pesticides and herbicides provided by the government, and were found to have increased vegetable production. Their compliance with the state apparatus and to the agricultural technology enabled them to become the main suppliers of the several vegetables in Ambon city including tomatoes, chilies, eggplants, groundnuts, beans and cucumbers. As the Butonese profited off of the sale of vegetables, they were able to discontinue their work in clove plantations owned by Moluccans landlords.<sup>14</sup>

In Hila and Kaitetu, Bertrand found that the local Moluccans had become disengaged and suspicious of government agricultural projects as well as the overall intentions of the State. They neglected to return government credit as they mistakenly assumed that the credit was simply government-issued money. To overcome distrust and suspicion within the Moluccan community, Bertrand reported that the government changed the credit to the full subsidiary on seeds and fertilizers. The new strategy implemented by the government was to give pure grants of fertilizers, seedlings, pesticides and money for tools. After receiving this money, local people often ignored the government extension services (PPL), because they believed that they knew more than PPL about handling crops.

---

13 See Jacques Bertrand. *Compliance, resistance, and trust: peasants and the state in Indonesia*. (PhD Dissertation, Princeton University 1995) at 181.

14 *ibid*, 320-321

Because the Butonese lacked the right to own land, younger Butonese tended to work in money-making occupations outside of land-based industries. Unlike local people, migrant traders were more responsive to economic activity involving actual cash flow. Many Butonese traders marketed cloves because it was a lucrative commodity. They rented orchards, made a profit off of their harvests, and shared income with local Moluccans.<sup>15</sup> In the village of Tanjung (Yainuelo) of South Seram in the 1990s, the rapid and spontaneous influx of Butonese, combined with the opening up of the road-building program—the “Trans Seram Highway”—catalyzed the integration of local people into the market economy. For example, Butonese farmers leased land from indigenous people, including the Nuaulu. On that land, they cultivated cash crops.<sup>16</sup>

In the 1980s, the Butonese began to acquire their own capital and establish businesses. In several areas, such as at the district of Tulehu on Ambon island, they owned almost the entire fleet of large wooden rafts (*bagan*) for fishing. These were important for catching the small fish consumed for food but also as a means of earning small amounts of cash. Since then, there has been a great transformation in sea transportation and the Butonese have also started to own fast motorboats with which they could cover greater area. By the beginning of the 1980s, they had begun to overtake Bugis and Makassarese, migrants from Sulawesi Island, who had dominated middle-range trading niches and sea transport since the seventeenth century. Moreover, many Butonese who had previously worked on ethnic Chinese-owned boats started to purchase their own vessels. Starting in the 1990s, Butonese controlled road transportation. They bought minibuses and employed native Moluccans. In this way, the Butonese came to dominate a large part of the modern transport system. By the end of the New Order, the Butonese had become dominant entrepreneurs that could build their network based on support from ethnic Chinese wholesalers in addition to their own communities.

Social mobility was the central concern of the life of Butonese migrants. In only two generations, they went from being cultivators of maize and cassava to traders and merchants. Although local Muslim and Christian Moluccans dominated the top civil service positions at the provincial level, migrant traders could affect the balance of power through their economic leverage. When the sectarian conflict broke out in 1999, a precipitating issue was jealousy toward BBM (Butonese, Bugis and Makasarese) traders who dominated much of the market in Ambon.

---

15 Otto Hospes, who did his research in Tulehu, 25 km northeast of the town of Ambon, reported that Butonese migrants started to make a profit in the pre-harvest agreements. They rented numbers of clove trees using long-term contracts, for example, over five years in length. Otto Hospes. *People That Count: Changing Savings and Credit Practices in Ambon, Indonesia*. Wageningen: publisher not identified, (Thesis Wageningen Agricultural University, 1996).

16 See the transformation of South Seram and its effect on the Nuaulu, the indigenous people, in Roy Ellen “Pengetahuan tentang hutan, transformasi hutan: ketidakpastian politik, sejarah ekologi, dan renegosiasi terhadap alam di Seram Tengah”. In *Proses transformasi daerah pedalaman di Indonesia*, Tania Murray Li (ed.) (Yayasan Obor Indonesia, Jakarta 2002) at 205-246

Many people suspected that the reason why the Butonese became targets in the conflict was because both Christians and Muslims were surprised when the Butonese improved their economic position so quickly. Muslims and Christians transformed the issue into a major conflict. The Butonese experienced severe problems and many were persecuted and fled. Their houses were destroyed and the majority who had settled in Christian neighborhoods were violently expelled, despite having lived there for generations. Christians deliberately took away land and the Butonese were prohibited from returning.

### 3. Butonese Relationships with their Patron Village after the War

Under the New Order regime, the Butonese had no right to access *adat* land. They could only become a tenant if they worked on the Moluccas land. By living on the Moluccas land (*petuanan*), the Butonese also had no right to be involved in any meeting regarding with custom policies. All of the political decisions, including the election of raja, is discussed in *mata rumah*, which literally the core of the house, “house of local legislative based on the selected marga.” A claim position of raja is based on the lineage and historical legitimation from the *mata rumah*. Because the Butonese have no family clan name (*marga*), they were not allowed to participate in the raja election process. Since the Butonese are excluded from having *adat* rights, they relied on the State funds and government as described above by Bertrand in the case of Hitu Peninsula. Compared to the Jacques Bertrand’s report about the Butonese compliance during the New Order, the post-order Butonese were more critical to government programs. This research found that democracy encouraged every citizen to be aware of their political and economic rights, regardless of ethnicity.

The ethnographic fieldwork for this research was first conducted in September 2015, more than a decade after the communal conflict ended. In observing the difference between the *desa induk* and the *anak dusun*, the authors found a gap between the relative development of Soahuku and Aira, its Butonese *anak dusun*. The neighborhood in Soahuku was neatly ordered. The fences, gardens, roofs, and lawns were well maintained. Most of the alleys were very well-paved. In contrast, many Butonese houses were still built from wood. The walls were made from the stalks of sago tree (*gaba-gaba*) and the roofs were made from sago-leaf thatch. Some of the neighborhoods were dense. The houses were very close together with no alleys and no yards. Many newly built houses faced random directions. This neighborhood differed from Tanjung (Yainuelo), another Butonese village, where many affluent concrete houses were been built because the village economy profited off of fishing and crop-ownership.<sup>17</sup> After the conflict, Yainuelo separated from their Moluccan *tuan desa*,

---

17 Yainuelo is given as the official name of the village in 2014. Yainuelo means the village of coconut (*desa kelapa*).

Sepa. Yainuelo has since become an independent administrative village that receives a one-billion rupiah subsidy from the central government.

The head of village (*raja*) of Soahuku shared that, after the conflict, international aid and government funds improved people's lives. Infrastructural progress and social welfare improved in Soahuku. The optimistic perspective of this village head, however, was at odds with the local Butonese point of view. So far, as the *raja* put it, Aira is the "child of village" of Soahuku. The Butonese in Aira call the Christian village of Soahuku *desa induk* ('core', or 'mother' village), while Aira, the Butonese Muslim village, is called anak dusun or 'child of the village'. As in the relationship between a mother and a child, there is always tension between the *desa induk* and the anak dusun. The aid was always prioritized for Soahuku, Aira received only *remah-remah* (what was left over). Ahmadi, head of the hamlet of Aira, talked about the possibility of Aira converting from *dusun* (a kind of village sub-unit) to *desa* (village). Once in 2014, he met Raja of Soahuku to tell her about his plan to *memekarkan* (develop) the hamlet.<sup>18</sup> The word *pemekaran* literally means blossoming. There is a decentralization law about the formation of any new province, municipality, district, subdistrict or *desa* from a smaller administrative unit. The aim of this law is to ensure a fair distribution of resources, the absorption of government subsidies, and the enforcement of a representative government. In many cases, *pemekaran* has led to a dramatic increase in tension between local elites who hold to the status quo, against those who demand a new administrative village and wish to gain from the *pemekaran*. The multiplication of villages often weakens and undermines the traditional authority of *adat* leaders.

The Raja was angry and said that she did not want to allow Aira to become a *desa administratif* (administrative village). To establish a *desa administratif*, according to national government policy, there should be at least 200 *kepala keluarga* (heads of household). Aira had met the minimum requirement to become a *desa*, as in 2016 it had 250 *kepala keluarga*. By becoming independent, Aira would administratively separate from the former *desa induk* (core village) of Soahuku. In addition, the people in Aira could also then administer their own aid and funds that would come directly from the government without having to pass through the Raja of Soahuku. In Aira, people are enthusiastic to take advantage of a government program that provides one billion rupiah for each poor village every year. People hope that this will enable them

---

18 However, a big village that has a wide area, like Sepa, tends to form new villages (*desa*) such as Tanjung and Nuane at kilo 12. This is because more villages means more money obtained via subsidies from the State. (Dana Desa) as much as one billion rupiah per year. For more study see, Birgit Brauchler, Indonesia: Decentralisation and Local Power Struggles in Maluku, *International Crisis Group*, Jakarta/Brussels 22 May 2007. John Sidel, 2008 "The Manifold Meanings of Displacement: Explaining Inter-religious violence 1999-2001" at, 29-59, Cornell University Southeast Asia Program. Todd Ryan Hooe, 2012: at 263-271 "Little Kingdoms: Adat and Inequality in the Kei Islands, Eastern Indonesia. PhD dissertation, University of Pittsburgh. In the case of West Seram, Brauchler shows that the *pemekaran* has helped to foster Butonese participation in regional politics. See Birgit Bräuchler Feb 2017, 1-16: Changing patterns of mobility, citizenship and conflict in Indonesia, *Social Identities*.

to fix their infrastructure—to build roads, mosques, houses, and bridges. However, the Raja of Soahuku has prioritized developing another village - Soahuku Islam (for the community of native Moluccan Muslims who, at present, live in one village together with Soahuku Christians) - that also wants to separate from Soahuku Kristen. Raja Soahuku would benefit, too, if the population in Soahuku village decreased because each poor family would get a greater subsidy. During debates in the village, a *pendatang*, the Butonese in Aira continued to be treated with less respect than received by either the local Christians or the Muslims in Soahuku.

It was obvious that the people of Aira envied those of Soahuku. Butonese people felt blessed to be receiving aid, but they were still dissatisfied with the method by which they received it. Many Butonese felt bad about the unequal state of conditions between Aira and Soahuku. Almost all of the aid from the government went to Soahuku; Aira only received leftovers. It was common to hear women complain about rice coupons that were randomly dispersed to Aira only once every three or four months. People were mad about the quality of rice subsidy that they received. They complained that the quality was poor, and that it was only good enough to feed their chickens. The government also prioritized Soahuku over Aira in housing subsidy distributions. To receive aid for a house, they had to wait longer than those who lived in Soahuku. Likewise, Butonese in Aira village were hesitant to believe that the State would double the fund to the poor villages in their planning in 2016 and 2017. The Butonese were treated as a second-class citizen.

In addition their frustration with their *desa negeri*, people in Aira was also mad that the bureaucrats in Soahuku mismanaged funds for rice from the poor program (*raskin*). Rice for poor was often misplaced, where the poor did not receive it. Instead, the *raskin* was given double, to two people in one household, and most of the time, the quality was low. This misplaced funding demonstrates the ignorance of the bureaucrats in Soahuku regarding their Butonese clients in Aira.

As a consequence of being excluded from land access, Butonese tended to become shop-owners and middlemen providing goods across the islands. Some stories of the upward mobility of urban Butonese entrepreneurs reflect a linear evolutionary pattern. The first generation of Butonese consisted mostly of farmers working on the Moluccan-owned land. Then, they became tenants for the pre-harvest arrangements in the villages. Then, the next Butonese generation acquired sufficient capital and contacts to become moneylenders, middlemen, and shop owners in the late 1990s and after the *kerusuhan*. Butonese migrants also developed the capacity to finance trade in natural resources (*hasil bumi*) such as cloves, nutmeg, copra, durian, and coconut. Many of them developed networks with ethnic Chinese shopkeepers and wholesalers as their partners.

### III. CONCLUSION: ETHNIC AND RELIGIOUS DIVISIONS IN THE POST REFORMATIONS

Under the decentralization era, both local Moluccans and migrants Butonese worked to define their own versions of human rights. As autochthonous people (*orang pribumi*), the local Moluccans requested their collective cultural rights or so called *adat* rights movement. Collective cultural rights are granted strictly to one group that belongs in authentic custom. One of the aims of *adat* rights movement is that the local can access economy and environment resources. As a consequence of *adat* right movement, migrants became excluded. The *adat* movement introduced extraordinary opportunities for blocking migrants from getting their individual rights as citizens of Indonesia. As a result, distinctions between insiders and outsiders have sharpened and have potentially precipitated horizontal conflict.<sup>19</sup>

Ethnic consciousness is now reformulated in the form of collective human rights. Without marginalizing the individual rights, the ethnic consciousness can empower a person be able to demand recognition. By somehow creating cultural authenticity, the indigenous revival movements have the potential to put migrants in precarious positions. The Butonese were vulnerable during their flight from the original conflict and relocation; their oral sharecropping arrangements; and through their status as second-class citizen while receiving funds, which had to be passed through the *desa negeri* first. Unclear ownership agreements led to many disputes between the Butonese and the Moluccans regarding land management and boundaries. In some instances, conditions after the conflict precipitated land disputes in urban areas. The Butonese occupied places like the village of Waiheru and the village of Ahuru. The Catholic churches that fled during the conflict own mostly lands in these areas. The disputes emerged when Catholics reclaimed their land after the conflict. Similar problems also happened in Poka Rumah Tiga, Batu Kuning and Tantui, where many Butonese occupied arable land during the conflict. Now, instead of there being a kind of peace, there is widespread displeasure among Muslims and Christians toward the Butonese, who are seen very economically aggressive.<sup>20</sup>

The spirit of *adat* revivalism excluded migrants from accessing economic resources or positions in local governments. In the case of the research that precipitated this paper, the post-reformation experienced a re-establishment of a neo-hierarchical reciprocity, in which the local Moluccans and the *raja* as used privilege to siphon state

---

19 David Bouchier, 'The romance of adat in the Indonesian political imagination and the current revival.' in Davidson, Jamie and Henley, David *Revival of Tradition in Indonesian Politics: the Deployment of Adat from Colonialism to Indigenism*, (Abingdon, Oxon, NY: Routledge, 2007) at 124; Tania Murray Li. *The will to improve: governmentality, development, and the practice of politics*. (Durham: Duke University Press 2007)

20 Jeroen Adam. 'Communal Violence, Forced Migration and Social Change on the Island of Ambon, Indonesia.' [PhD dissertation, Ghent University, 2009], at 185

funds away from the Butonese. In order to increase their status from *anak dusun*, Butonese hamlet enhances their status by establishing a new administrative village. The village of Yainuelo was once under the authority of Sepa Village. In 2004, Yainuelo officially declared themselves a new, independent administrative village. The population of people of Butonese descent in Yainuelo increased after the conflict as they received many who fled from other islands, such as Saparua, which enabled them fulfil the population requirement stipulated in village establishment. In establishing their own village, the Butonese expected to participate in government projects and stand as full citizens before the State, even though they were considered citizen under *adat* terms.

In addition, the migrant Butonese had not yet essentialised their sense of ethnic belonging. Migrant Butonese constructed their cultures through their pragmatic interests. In the sharecropping system, they built their relationship with the *tuan dusun* (landowner) while increasing their productivity and hoping that, someday, they could take over or buy the land. Within villages, the migrants, composing a minority, were not allowed to conduct their rituals and ceremonies. The hopelessness of their situation pushed the Butonese to assert their right to be recognized through renaming their identities. The Butonese did this through syncretic organizations, such as *Badan Keturunan Masyarakat Sulawesi Tenggara* (Committee of the Descendants of Southeast Sulawesi Society) *Badan Keturunan Masyarakat Maluku - Sulawesi Tenggara* (Committee of the Descendants of Moluccan Society - Southeast Sulawesi).<sup>21</sup> The Butonese-Moluccan relationships can be identified using two complementary aspects of hierarchical reciprocity and moral order. The Butonese are inferior because their identities

Are migrants, and the Moluccans are more superior as they are the host of the society. Despite their differences, each of the groups independently conceives of its relationship and engages in activities that take place in the realms of agriculture, commodity markets, and government aid. The dualism, therefore, is not to simply be conceived as a complementary opposite, but rather, a dialectic relationship of gift exchanges and general reciprocity.

Because of the hierarchical reciprocity with their native Moluccan landowners, the Butonese shared a moral compass and sense of belonging with the Moluccans rather than with their ethnic origins. The Butonese elevate the places of the Moluccas as those where they have belonged through narrative remembrance of previous lives, as well as through their fond relationship with the *tuan dusun* (Moluccan landowners) and *raja* (the head village). Borrowing the concept of the “poetics of space”, the displaced Butonese built new settlement forms and realigned their reciprocity with their new village *rajas*.<sup>22</sup> Through the poetics of space, the Butonese constructed their locality and

---

21 Ibid at 185-186.

22 Rupert Stasch, “The poetic of village space when villages are new. Settlements form as history

sense of social belonging, and it became a concrete way for them to deal with external forces, including the displacement that resulted from the conflict. As explained in this paper, the displaced Butonese from six *kampongs* in Saparua tended to move to other Butonese kampongs in the Moluccas, such as Aira and Tanjung, rather than move back to their place of origin in Buton, Southeast Sulawesi.

The problematic connection between collective human rights and the Western notion of human rights is the emphasis on the right of individuality. The next problem to investigate has to do with how the revival of tradition in the Moluccas progressed without excluding the rights to culture for ‘outsiders’. Brauchler (2010) offers cultural reinterpretation of adat as a constructive meaning-making ideology for post-colonial Moluccans.<sup>23</sup> Thus, local people, as well as the migrants, can coexist their cultures flexibly. This thought can not only reduce the great distance between them, but also can translate the notion of democratic human right principles into local context.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adam, Jeroen, ‘Communal Violence, Forced Migration and Social Change on the Island of Ambon, Indonesia.’ [PhD dissertation, Ghent University, 2009].
- Benda-Beckmann, Franz von, “Myths and Stereotypes about Adat Law: A Reassessment of Van Vollenhoven in the light of current struggles over adat law in Indonesia” (2001) *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde*.
- Benda-Beckmann, Franz von, *Social Security Between Past and Future: Ambonese Networks of Care and Support*. (Münster: LIT 2007).
- Bertrand, Jacques, *Compliance, resistance, and trust: peasants and the state in Indonesia*. (PhD Dissertation, Princeton University 1995).
- Bourchier, David, ‘The romance of adat in the Indonesian political imagination and the current revival.’ in Davidson, Jamie and Henley, David *Revival of Tradition in Indonesian Politics: the Deployment of Adat from Colonialism to Indigenism*, (Abingdon, Oxon, NY: Routledge, 2007).
- Bräuchler, Birgit, “The Revival Dilemma: Reflections on Human Rights, Self-Determination and Legal Pluralism in Eastern Indonesia”. (2010) *The Journal of Legal Pluralism*.
- Chatterjee, Partha. *The Politics of the Governed: Reflections on Popular Politics in Most of the World*. (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 2007).

---

making in Papua, Indonesia”. (2013) *American Ethnologist*, Vol 40. No. 3, at 555-

23 Birgit Bräuchler, “The Revival Dilemma: Reflections on Human Rights, Self-Determination and Legal Pluralism in Eastern Indonesia”. (2010) *The Journal of Legal Pluralism*. (62) at 1-42.

- Duncan, Christopher, *Violence and vengeance: religious conflict and its aftermath in eastern Indonesia*. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2013).
- Effendi, Ziwari SH, *Hukum Adat Ambon-Lease*. (Pradnya Paramita, Jakarta, 1987).
- Ellen, Roy, "Pengetahuan tentang hutan, transformasi hutan: ketidakpastian politik, sejarah ekologi, dan renegosiasi terhadap alam di Seram Tengah". In *Proses transformasi daerah pedalaman di Indonesia*, Tania Murray Li (ed.) (Yayasan Obor Indonesia, Jakarta 2002).
- Ellen, Roy, 'Social theory, ethnography and the understanding of practical Islam in South-East Asia.' *Islam in South-East Asia*, M.B. Hooker (ed.) (E.J. Brill: Leiden, 1983).
- Hart, Gillian P, *Power, labor, and livelihood: Processes of change in rural Java*. (Berkeley: University of California Press 1986).
- Hospes, Otto, *People That Count: Changing Savings and Credit Practices in Ambon, Indonesia*. Wageningen: publisher not identified, (Thesis Wageningen Agricultural University, 1996).
- Kennedy, Raymond, *Field notes on Indonesia: Ambon and Ceram, 1949-1950*, ed. by Harold Conklin. HRAF. (1955).
- Latinis, David Kyle, Protohistoric "Archaeology and Settlement in Central Maluku, Eastern Indonesia. (PhD Thesis, National University of Singapore, 2008).
- Lee, Juliet, "The changing face of the village in Ambon". (1997) *Cakalele: Maluku Research Journal*.
- Li, Tania Murray, "Masyarakat Adat, Difference, and the Limits of Recognition in Indonesia's Forest Zone". (2001) *Modern Asian Studies*.
- Li, Tania Murray, *The will to improve: governmentality, development, and the practice of politics*. (Durham: Duke University Press 2007)
- Palmer, Blair, "Migrasi dan identitas: perantau Buton yang kembali ke Buton setelah konflik Maluku 1999-2002". (2004) *Antropologi Indonesia : Majalah Antropologi Sosial Dan Budaya Indonesia*.
- Stasch, Rupert, "The poetic of village space when villages are new. Settlements form as history making in Papua, Indonesia". (2013) *American Ethnologist*.
- Subair, Syamsul Amal, and Moh. Yamin Rumra, *Segregasi pemukiman berdasar agama: solusi atau ancaman? : pendekatan sosiologis filosofis atas interaksi sosial antara orang Islam dan orang Kristen pasca konflik 1999-2004 di Kota Ambon*. (Yogyakarta: Graha Guru bekerja sama dengan Institut Agama Islam (IAIN) Ambon, Maluku, 2008)
- Tomsa, Dirk, "Electoral democracy in a divided society: The 2008 gubernatorial election in Maluku, Indonesia", (2009) *South East Asia Research*, Vol. 17.

Zakaria, R, Yando, *Abih tandeh: masyarakat desa di bawah rejim Orde Baru*. Pasar Minggu, (Jakarta: Lembaga Studi dan Advokasi Masyarakat, 2000).

**Hatib Abdul Kadir** a is a recipient of Fulbright Doctor Fellowship in 2012-2015. Recipient Ethnographic Summer Field School, Tallahassee, Florida, funded by NSF (National Science Foundation) in 2016. He is now also a lecturer in the department of Anthropology, Brawijaya University. His research interest is in ethnography, indigeneity, and internal migration in Indonesia.